

Item No.	Application and Parish	No. 8/13 Week Date	Proposal, Location and Applicant
(5)	13/01849/LBC Newbury.	14 <sup>th</sup> October 2013	Change of Use and conversion of the main Grade II Listed pub building and two outbuildings into 4 new residential units. Demolition of rear extension to main building, garage/store and toilet blocks, extension linking main building to function suite and boundary wall adjacent to Derby Road. Hard and soft landscaping and provision of 3 car park spaces. Wellington Arms, 4 Andover Road, Newbury, Berkshire, RG14 6LR. Vokins Construction.

To view the plans and drawings relating to this application click the following link:

<http://planning.westberks.gov.uk/rpp/index.asp?caseref=13/01849/LBC>

**Recommendation Summary:**

To **DELEGATE** to the Head of Planning and Countryside to **GRANT** Planning Permission subject to the schedule of conditions (section 8.2).

**Ward Member(s):**

Cllr M Johnston and Cllr I Tuck.

**Reason for Committee determination:**

Called to Committee by adjoining Ward Member Cllr A Edwards as building is one of the oldest historical pubs in Newbury and as a Grade II listed building it should be retained as a pub and not converted into residential use.

**Committee Site Visit:**

9<sup>th</sup> December 2013.

**Contact Officer Details**

<b>Name:</b>	Jake Brown
<b>Job Title:</b>	Senior Planning Officer
<b>Tel No:</b>	(01635) 519 111
<b>E-mail Address:</b>	<a href="mailto:JPBrown@westberks.gov.uk">JPBrown@westberks.gov.uk</a>

## **1. Relevant Site History**

Application Reference: 142551 – Demolition and rebuilding of chimney stack. Application approved 4<sup>th</sup> May 1993.

Application Reference: 126921 - Improvements including new toilet facilities. Application approved 2<sup>nd</sup> October 1986.

Application Reference: 126920 (LBC) - Internal bar alterations and extension to improve toilet facilities. Application approved 2<sup>nd</sup> October 1986.

## **2. Publicity of Application**

Site notice expired: 1<sup>st</sup> October 2013.

Neighbour Notification expired 18<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

## **3. Consultations and Representations**

**Parish Council:** No objection: Comment: Members requested that the external design is retained, the internal staircase is somehow retained, pictures be retained or donated to West Berkshire Museum.

**Newbury Society:** Although The Society is disappointed at this loss of an historic pub, we welcome this proposal to retain this heritage building at one of the gateways to Newbury. We welcome the retention of the historic fireplace. We would like inclusion of plans to ensure that the historic pictures and artefacts are safely retained.

**Ancient Monuments Society:** Would prefer existing staircase retained. It is an attractive feature and would be wasteful to demolish it. It also contributes to the significance of the listed building, and therefore its removal needs to be justified.

**20th Century Society:** No response received.

**Society For The Protection Of Ancient Buildings:** No response received.

**Victorian Society:** No response received.

**The Council for British Archaeology:** No response received.

**Georgian Group:** No response received.

**Conservation  
Officer  
(1<sup>st</sup> response):**

The applications are accompanied by a detailed Design & Access and a detailed Heritage (Impact) Statement. The only concern in respect of the latter is that it stops short of assessing the architectural and/or historic significance of the existing staircase and a case for its removal. It is understood that further information is to be requested in this respect. Apart from that however, the proposed works to the listed building are adequately detailed and justified, involve limited intervention into historic structures, and/or re-use of existing openings, thereby considerably improving the external appearance of the building, particularly at the rear. The proposals will also secure the future use of the building. On balance therefore the proposals are likely to be considered acceptable from a building conservation point of view (notwithstanding that there may be other planning issues to take into account such as the justification of the the loss of the public house).

**Conservation  
Officer  
(amended plans):**

Object: The essential difference between the originally submitted proposals and those now submitted is the loss of one parking space and the relocation of the bin/cycle store from within the site to a position in front of the Derby Road front elevation of the main building. Although the lower/western part of this elevation is currently screened behind a high brick wall, the original proposals would have opened this up to view, and as such were preferable to the current proposal to erect a bin/cycle store in front of it, since the retention and enhancement of the street scene view of this important corner building should be a primary aim in terms of the character and appearance of both the listed building and that of the conservation area in which it lies. The introduction of a new and fairly utilitarian structure in this location is therefore considered detrimental to the character and appearance of the listed building/conservation area.

The details of the internal conversion have not changed, but the Heritage Statement goes a little further in justifying the loss of the existing staircase between the ground and first floor of the core building. Paragraph 5.1.4 describes changes in the vicinity of the staircase and 8.1.6 acknowledges that its removal will involve a loss of historic fabric, evidential and aesthetic values, having a minor negative effect on the heritage significance of the property, although mitigated by the retention of the external form and character of the building and the enhancement of its condition and contribution to the conservation area. On balance, I would tend to go along with this conclusion, on the basis that otherwise the interior of the building has previously been much altered to accommodate its existing/former use, although minimum change is now proposed to its overall compartmentalisation.

**Conservation Officer (further amended plans):** The reversion of the bin/cycle store to its originally proposed position is preferred from a building conservation point of view in terms of protecting /enhancing the character and setting of the proposed development on the site and particularly the listed building and the conservation area in which it is situated. It is noted that the bin/cycle store will be in "bricks to match", which is clearly welcomed. It is further noted that submission of samples of external materials will be required as a condition of any consent. Whilst it is noted that no further attention has been given to retaining the wall on the northwest boundary to a greater height than proposed - to provide better privacy, etc for the occupiers of the site and neighbouring properties (and more visible evidence of former buildings on the site) - this is not, by itself, considered detrimental to the *prima facie* building conservation aspects of the overall proposals of retaining an important listed building in (appropriate) use.

One small point, is that the ground floor plan drawing (3805.PL06E) appears to show "landscaping", including in front of the Derby Road frontage of the main building, whereas the block plan (3805.PL13C) does not. It would be appropriate to clarify what is actually proposed here, in order to assess any potential impact on "setting", since a generally open aspect would be preferred in this location.

**Representations:** No letters of representation received.

#### **4. Policy and Legislation Considerations**

4.1 The West Berkshire Core Strategy has been adopted by the Council and as such now forms the Local Plan. Therefore the following policies carry significant weight in the decision making process:

- NPPF Policy
- Area Delivery Plan Policy 1: Spatial Strategy
- Area Delivery Plan Policy 2: Newbury
- CS 14: Design Principles
- CS 19: Historic Environment and Landscape Character

4.2 The West Berkshire Core Strategy replaced a number of Planning Policies in the West Berkshire District Local Plan 1991-2006 Saved Policies 2007. However the following Policies remain in place until they are replaced by development plan documents and should be given due weight according to their degree of consistency with the National Planning Policy Framework:

- HSG1: The Identification of Settlements for Planning Purposes
- TRANS1: Meeting the Transport Needs of New development
- OVS5: Environmental Nuisance and Pollution Control

4.3 Other material considerations for this application which includes government guidance are:

- The National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) (NPPF).
- The Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended).
- The Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010.
- Circular 11/95 - The use of conditions in planning permissions.
- Supplementary Planning Guidance SPG 19 Public Houses.

- Supplementary Planning Document “Quality Design” (adopted June 2006).
- National Planning Practice Guidance (Draft).
- Newbury Town Design Statement.

## 5. Description of Development

5.1 This application seeks permission for the change of use and conversion of a public house known as The Wellington Arms to 4 residential units comprising 1 no. one bed unit and 3 no. two bed units. To accommodate the conversion the existing single storey toilet block to the rear of the public house is to be demolished. The toilet block was given approval in 1986 (ref: 126921).

5.2 The application site is located within the settlement boundary of Newbury and within the designated Conservation Area.

5.3 The site is a Grade II listed, early 19<sup>th</sup> century public house. The list entry describes the site as a pair of semi-detached houses that were later modified into a single property, however no historical or archaeological evidence has been found to support this. The site abuts No. 6 Andover Road to the south-west which does have evidence that it was previously two houses.

5.4 The street front elevation of the public house faces south-east and the east corner forms a curved bow. The property has been extended with a single storey to the north-west and another to the west which links the public house to adjacent rectangular and irregular plan buildings. A small yard to the rear of the public house provides access to these adjacent buildings and two additional buildings contained within the site.

## 6. Consideration of the Proposal

The main issue to consider is:-

6.1 The impact on the Listed Building and its setting  
 6.2 Other Matters

### 6.1 The impact on the Listed Building and its setting

6.1.1 In respect of the impact on the listed building the proposal would remove some modern single storey elements within the courtyard. To the rear of the property, the linking structure and external metal staircase will be removed to create a private open space. The south-west building will have original windows reopened on the ground floor and floor length windows inserted within existing door openings on the first floor. Internally, new partitions will create a bathroom, bedroom and kitchen/dining room on the ground floor and an ensuite bathroom, storeroom, bedroom and living room on the first floor. The existing roof light will be retained whereas a new staircase will be fitted to replace the current spiral stair.

6.1.2 Pub fixtures and fittings will be removed from the public house building. On the south-east elevation the southern door will be fixed shut rather than removed to maintain the appearance of the Andover Road façade. The existing staircase between the public house ground and first floor will be removed and a new stairwell located further north-west on the site of the current toilets. This will alter access and circulation through the building. Currently the corridor forms the long central spine of the first floor from which all first floor rooms are accessed. Proposed access to the first floor corridor will be in the middle rather than the end of the corridor which will effectively divide the first floor into a northern and southern half.

6.1.3 Partitions will be added in the current bar area to form a bedroom and contiguous living/dining/kitchen space. On the first floor, the east side of the corridor will be removed to create a larger living/dining and kitchen area. The internal curved wall will be retained within the living/dining room circulation space whereas the existing stairwell will be converted to an ensuite bathroom to the south-west room (bedroom) and a seating alcove within the living/dining room. The north rooms are currently similar in size each with a blocked corner hearth. New partitions within the west room will create more storage space and decrease the size of the bathroom, disrupting the plan-form symmetry of this end of the building. Proposals indicate the blocked corner hearths will exist entirely within the east room bedroom and storage space rather than in separate rooms.

6.1.4 The former stable's south-east elevation will have the blocked opening to the north of the existing door reopened and converted to an almost floor length window. Similarly the hayloft dormer will be converted from door to window to light the upper floor. The northwest and north-east elevations will remain blind. Internally, a staircase will be added to the north-west corner and new partitions will create a bathroom in the ground floor southwest corner. The east half of the ground floor will become a living/dining and kitchen space. The upper storey will have its floor truncated on the east side to form a void overlooking the ground floor. This means the first floor bedroom will gain additional natural light via the ground floor windows.

6.1.5 The north-east boundary wall and former coach house will be removed to create parking spaces and the pavement modified to create a dropped kerb onto Derby Road. The toilet block will be replaced with a bin and cycle store, existing planters adjacent to the former stable will be removed but new planters added elsewhere. The yard will form a constricted space between the decking and cycle store but opens out to private gardens to the south and parking to the north.

6.1.6 The Wellington Arms is located south of three nearby listed buildings and features prominently in views looking south-west from the Church and more obliquely or partially when viewed from the others. The setting of these listed buildings will be impacted by the planned development as they will face towards the public house structure's street front elevations with parking spaces and cycle store in the foreground and planted areas behind as opposed to the current view of street front elevations and plain boundary wall.

6.1.7 The National Planning Policy Framework emphasizes the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and the necessity of maintaining listed buildings in viable use for the purposes of conservation, rather than leave them neglected to fall into ruin. The conversion to residential use will keep the building occupied, the better for its conservation and maintenance which is considered to weigh in favour of the proposal.

6.1.8 The NPPF highlights the contribution of heritage assets to the economic vitality of an area and to sustainable communities. Since the mid-20th century, the site area has evolved from a prosperous commercial and social junction to a residential locus, as indicated by the demolition of two of the three public houses based here. The site's communal value and economic viability as a public house has decreased over time. The addition of new residential units to the suburb will help sustain the community rather than retain a public house that may struggle to survive financially. This is considered to weigh in favour of the proposal.

6.1.9 Internally, the layout will be altered to subdivide the single property into four residences. This will involve the relocation of the stairwell between ground and first floors and the removal and creation of a number of internal partition walls within the public house.

Although the bar area currently comprises a single L-shaped space, the presence of two original doors and the location of chimney stacks above indicate the room was originally subdivided in two. Although the internal sub-division at ground floor will not reinstate the original form, the scale of spaces created will not be inappropriate. On the other hand, the interior will lose the remaining fixtures and fittings relating to its original commercial function.

6.1.10 The relocation of the stairwell changes the circulation through the building particularly at first floor level where removal and reinstatement of dividing walls increases the proportions of the eastern rooms and obscures the original layout. The removal of the existing staircase will result in a loss of historic fabric, evidential and aesthetic values. This change weighs against the proposal as it will have a negative impact on the heritage significance of the property; however it is considered that the staircase is typical for the age and scale of the property and similar examples are commonplace. Therefore, its loss is partially mitigated and of less consequence when considered in relation to the retention of the external form and character of the building, and the enhancement of its condition and contribution to the Conservation area.

6.1.11 In the yard, the earliest parts of the property comprising the northern boundary wall and the majority of the former coach house will be removed; the coach house walls which currently form the eastern extent of the property will be retained. These features are probably the surviving remnants of the Bull and Dog public house which previously occupied the Andover – Derby Road junction. Overall, the proposals will decrease the site's evidential value as regards its commercial use and chronological development. This weighs against the proposal as it will have a negative impact on the heritage significance of the property.

6.1.12 Overall the site's historical value will be moderately affected by the proposed development which is considered to result in a neutral impact. The demolition of parts of the site increases the importance of historical sources to inform heritage research. The site is well documented through directory and cartographic sources but lacks photographic evidence and is poorly represented in local history studies.

6.1.13 The site's aesthetic value will be enhanced by increasing the yard area which is currently a narrow enclosed concrete space, converting it to landscaped shared and private gardens. These gardens will be partially visible from the street which is an improvement over the plain wall that currently forms the north-east site boundary. The public house building exterior will retain its architectural style and fenestration and therefore continue to compliment the adjacent property 6 Andover Road as contemporary structures. This is considered to weigh in favour of the proposal.

6.1.14 The architectural style and scale of the existing buildings will be maintained; the majority of alteration is internal or to the rear of the property, therefore the street front setting will only be moderately impacted. The road traffic of the junction will always be detraction to the setting of the listed buildings surrounding it. Therefore the three off-road parking spaces proposed is considered to be a relatively neutral addition to the setting of the all the nearby listed buildings. On balance it is considered that the proposal will have a positive impact on the site, its setting and that of nearby heritage assets.

6.1.15 Overall, the site will lose some of its evidential value due to the loss of historic fabric, particularly that relating to the late-18th century Bull and Dog property. However, this will be counterbalanced by the enhancement of its aesthetic and communal value and the continued occupation of the property to better ensure its protection and conservation. The original layout of the interior of the public house structure will be partially lost at ground floor and more extensively at first floor but the external form and architectural character will be preserved on the street front and enhanced to the rear by the removal of later single

storey elements. Similarly, the exterior of the former stable and south-west yard building will be enhanced by reopening blocked features. This will better reveal the character of the retained properties, and their physical and functional relationship within the site and its setting.

6.1.16 As such it is considered, on balance, that the impact on the listed building, its setting and the setting of the Conservation Area and nearby listed buildings would be acceptable.

## 6.2 Other Matters

### National Planning Policy Framework

6.2.1 The NPPF places a strong emphasis on sustainable development. All planning applications must result in sustainable development with consideration being given to economic, social and environmental sustainability aspects of the proposal. The proposed scheme is considered to be in a sustainable location and would not adversely impact upon the environmental and social sustainability for the reasons detailed above. The economic aspect of the proposal is considered to be limited. As these have been found acceptable the development is considered to constitute sustainable development in accordance with the NPPF.

### Landscaping

6.2.2 It is noted that the latest set of amended plans indicate some landscaping in front of the north-west elevation of the public house. The Conservation Officer has raised concern that landscaping here has potential to impact on the setting of this listed building. The landscaping would be strictly controlled by a condition attached to the planning permission. As such any potential impact on the setting of the listed building can be carefully controlled to ensure that no harm would occur as a result of landscaping.

## 7. Conclusion

7.1 Having taken account of all the relevant policy considerations and the other material considerations referred to above, it is considered that, although the considerations are finely balanced, the development proposed is considered to be acceptable and a conditional approval is justifiable for the following reasons.

7.2 The proposed use of the building is not considered to adversely impact upon the Listed Building or its setting. Whilst the site will lose some of its evidential value due to the loss of historic fabric, this is weighed against the enhancement of its aesthetic and communal value and the continued occupation of the property to better ensure its protection and conservation. The original layout of the interior of the public house structure will be partially lost at ground floor and more extensively at first floor but the external form and architectural character will be preserved on the street front and enhanced to the rear by the removal of later single storey elements. Similarly, the exterior of the former stable and south-west yard building will be enhanced by reopening blocked features. This will better reveal the character of the retained properties, and their physical and functional relationship within the site and its setting.

7.3 As such the application is considered to accord with National and Local Planning Policies as well as Supplementary Planning Guidance SPG 19 "Public Houses", Supplementary Planning Document "Quality Design" and the Newbury Town Design Statement.

## **8. Full Recommendation**

8.1 **DELEGATE** to the Head of Planning and Countryside to **GRANT** planning permission subject to the following conditions and informatives:

### **8.2 Schedule of conditions**

#### **Time limit**

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

#### **Approved plans**

2. This listed building consent relates only to work described on the drawings and the documents identified below:

Drawing title numbers 3805 PL06 E, 3805 PL07 C, 3805 PL08 D, 3805 PL10 D, 3805 PL11 D and 3805 PL13 C received on 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2013 and drawing title number PL01 received on 19<sup>th</sup> August 2013;

Design and Access Statement received on 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2013.

No work shall be carried out other than in accordance with the above drawings and documents.

Reason: To clarify what has been approved under this consent in order to protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building.

#### **Samples of materials**

3. No development shall commence on site until samples of the materials to be used in the development hereby permitted have been approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Samples shall be made available to be viewed at the site. This condition shall apply irrespective of any indications as to the details that may have been submitted with the application, and shall where necessary include the submission of samples of glass, plastic and mortar materials. Thereafter the materials used in the development shall be in accordance with the approved samples.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity in accordance with Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006 - 2026.

#### **Workmanlike Manner**

4. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in a proper workmanlike manner appropriate to the age and character of the building and using traditional materials and techniques except where the use of modern materials and techniques has specifically been approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the special historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

### **Finish to match original**

5. All works of making good and repair to the retained fabric, whether internal or external, shall be finished to match original work with regard to the methods used and to materials, colours, textures and profiles.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

### **New brickwork to match existing**

6. All new facing brickwork, including works of making good, shall match the existing brickwork in terms of bricks (size, colour and texture); mortar (mix, colour and texture); joint profile; and bond.

Reason: To ensure that the materials are appropriate to the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

### **No alteration of architectural features**

7. Unless such work is clearly and specifically referred to on drawings or other documents hereby approved, no existing features of architectural or historic interest such as doors, linings, shutters, panelling, cornicing, decorative plasterwork, floorboards, skirting, fireplaces, lath and plaster ceilings, wattle and daub panels shall be altered, replaced or removed until a written description of the steps to be taken has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter the development shall incorporate and be undertaken in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

### **Adequate protection and support**

8. Adequate protection and support to the building and adjacent structures shall be provided at all times during the work. Sufficient care shall be taken in the design and execution of all work, including any demolition and the preparation and the erection of any scaffolding, to ensure that no damage is incurred to the historic fabric of the building and adjacent structures.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building and adjacent structures. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

### **Details of external windows and doors**

9. No development shall take place until details of all new external windows and external doors have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details shall include materials and finishes, at a minimum scale of 1:20 and 1:2. The windows and doors shall be installed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

#### **Details of drainage, rainwater goods, flues etc.**

10. No development shall commence, and notwithstanding what is shown on the approved drawings or other approved documents, until details of the type and location of any new drainage pipework and accessories, rainwater goods, boiler flues, extract vent grilles, meter cupboards, external lighting etc. visible external to the building, including soil vent pipe terminations, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. No dwelling hereby permitted shall be occupied until the development has been carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

#### **Details of specific features**

11. Prior to the commencement of related work, details of the proposed staircase to include details of handrails and balusters and all new internal doors shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. No dwelling hereby permitted shall be occupied until the development has been carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the special architectural or historic interest of the building. This condition is imposed in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework (March 2012) and Policies CS14 and CS19 of the West Berkshire Core Strategy 2006-2026.

#### **8.3 Informatives**

1. This Listed Building Consent should be read in conjunction with associated planning permission 13/01848/FULD.
2. All bats are protected by The Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (WCA) (as amended) & [The Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010](#). Should you find bats during development, all work must stop until advice has been sought from Natural England. Their local contact number is 0300 060 3886.
3. This decision has been made in a positive way to foster the delivery of sustainable development having regard to Development Plan policies and available guidance to secure high quality appropriate development. In this application whilst there has been a need to balance conflicting considerations, the local planning authority has worked proactively with the applicant to secure and accept what is considered to be a development which improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of the area.

DC